letní semestr 2024/25

Fakulta architektury ČVUT v Praze diplomová práce – posudek oponenta název diplomové práce: The Neo Strahov

autor / autorka: Ronit Doshi

ateliér: Achten-Pavlíček-Sýsová

vedoucí diplomové práce: Prof.dr.ir. Henri Achten

odborný asistent / odborná asistentka: Ing. arch. Jiří Pavlíček, Ph.D.

oponent / oponentka: prof.ing.arch. Miloš Kopřiva

Slovní zhodnocení

(max 2000 znaků)

The Strahov stadium complex is unique in the world. The Masaryk Stadium was specifically designed to observe full-scale exercises of tens of thousands of trainees. Therefore, the stands of this stadium are not designed for viewing sports located at the foot of the stands in terms of visibility. Nevertheless, if the large capacity of the stadium's stands is preserved, it is necessary to find an answer as to why and for what purpose (apart from preserving the genius loci of the building) they could be used. The City of Prague has committed and continues to commit inappropriate interference in the Strahov complex with its original sporting intentions. Simply put: It is possible to place Sparta's training football pitches on an area of 300 x 200 m. Logically, however, this project probably should have included the stands, even if only partially. The stands should not be understood as a fence around the pitches. The multifunctional Rošický Stadium for football and athletics in one will now become a mono-functional "national" stadium for football only. The architect Dryák, winner of the 1926 competition, never designed it that way. If we take the decision of the City of Prague as a fact, it is appropriate to propose athletics as a spectator sport in a large stadium. An integral part of the ensemble are the CTU dormitories, formerly the trainers' changing rooms. The city's approach to its roughly 5,000 students does not offer any sports areas in the two main stadiums. So everything at Strahov will be for footballers only. The fate of the monolithic structures of the stands seems to be sealed. Just as a reminder of this fact, the topic of the thesis is very topical.

Urban concept

The urban design concept, which preserves the unique dimensions and area of the stadium, is the right step towards the public benefit use of Strahov. The sensitive undulation of the area in the middle, together with the division into outdoor sports sectors, appropriately divides the huge area. The insertion of green areas between the surfaces of the sports fields also contributes to the overall impression. The question remains whether the huge number of rows of stands around the stadium is functionally a bit too much just to observe what is happening on the surface. Perhaps occasional podiums could be stacked at the foot of the stands for cultural and social functions. This is mainly for college students and the public from the immediate area of Prague 6. It would be worth considering pushing atria into the area below the main level of the atrium, lighting the basements below the area.

Operational layout

I have several serious comments on the operational layout. The daylighting of the game gyms is not right for the athletes. It makes it difficult to estimate distance in ball sports. On the other hand, for swimming pools, glare is a necessity. Therefore, I would recommend reversing functions in the section. Put the pools above the sports halls. While doing so, remember that it is possible to float the pools with columns on the floor below. Which can be implemented in a suitable subdivision of the sports areas, where the supporting columns can be placed between the playing fields. If the functions are interchanged, it is logical to situate the high diving pool hall rather in the centre and the swimming pool with possible whirlpools and warmer leisure pools in the lower side parts.

Formální a grafické zpracování projektu, úplnost

(max 300 znaků)

The diploma project is clearly and graphically prepared. This also applies to the poster, where the main features of the proposal are highlighted. Such a unique topic deserves to be presented at a similar level.

Otázky k obhajobě

(volitelně, max 300 znaků)

- 1. What is the orientation of the longer axis of the outdoor pitches in relation to the cardinal points? Is it possible to rotate this axis slightly?
- 2. What is C value, what is its value (from lowest to highest value) and how is the visibility curve designed?

Závěrečné shrnutí a návrh známky

(max 500 znaků)

A very good analysis has been prepared for the project, and I have only one comment from the point of view of experience. Top athletes are something between 4 and 5 per cent of the population. For everyone else, over 80 percent, we need to visit a wide range of wellness facilities, which of course includes a lot of the activities that are in the thesis project.

The author of the thesis demonstrated that he is well acquainted with the issues of sports buildings. He has also very concisely set the objectives of his thesis within the analysis and has fulfilled them without fail. Perhaps the thesis could be published or made eligible for a student competition.

I suggest, in light of the above, a grade of A: Excellent

V Praze dne 28. 05. 2025

Jméno, příjmení a podpis prof.ing.arch. Miloš Kopřiva

Příloha

(případné další doplnění, které bude přílohou oponentního posudku)